

CHAPTER 3**METHODOLOGY AND SOURCES OF INFORMATION**

3.1 The purpose of this Study is to ascertain the facts pertaining to the six incident days and the two topics so as to:

- (a) facilitate the IPCC to examine at a later stage the Reportable Complaints arising from the six incident days and the two topics; and
- (b) identify any fault or deficiency in any police practices or procedures that might lead to complaints, and to make relevant recommendations to the Commissioner of Police in respect of such practices or procedures.

The IPCC has indicated to the Chief Executive that it intends to publish this Report for the information of the community. In this respect, the IPCC believes that it also has the effect of increasing the public's awareness of the role of the IPCC. The IPCC has also decided to submit this Report to the Chief Executive pursuant to section 30 of the IPCC Ordinance.

3.2 To achieve this purpose, this Study has been conducted in three stages, namely:

- (a) Fact Finding;
- (b) Assessment; and
- (c) Recommendations.

3.3 This is a Report on IPCC's findings as at 29 February 2020.

3.4 After collecting information from available sources on the six incident days and the facts relevant to the two topics including the circumstances under which the facts unfolded, the IPCC would duly assess all the materials and make recommendations in accordance with section 8(1)(c) of the IPCC Ordinance. The objective is to improve Police operations from a macro perspective.

3.5 The fact finding exercise in this Study is undertaken by a Task Force set up within the IPCC Secretariat, under the supervision of a Task Force Steering Group comprising the Chairmen of the Serious Complaints Committee, Operations Advisory Committee, Legal Committee and Publicity and Survey Committee, and in consultation with the International Expert Panel (IEP) on the approach and methodology in data collection and analysis. The IPCC's engagement with the IEP on the progress of the Study is outlined at Annex 1. This

Chapter outlines the methodology of the fact finding process, which includes collection of information, examination of data, and use of the materials for the purpose of the Study.

Collection of Information

3.6 The IPCC has endeavoured to cast the net as wide as possible to reconstruct the facts relevant to the Study. The major sources of information are:

Hong Kong Police Force

3.7 Since 2 July 2019, the IPCC has been in liaison with the Police for access to information on their handling of the public order events (POEs) in the six incident days and on the two topics under study. Prior to publication of this Report, there have been regular meetings and rounds of letter/memo/email correspondence with the Police on the relevant arrangements. Information has been collected from the Police through the following:

- (a) documentary materials and statistical information concerning Police manpower, deployment plan, summary brief and incident log, use of force, Letter of No Objection (LoNO) applications, police injuries on the six incident days under study; police weapons and use of force guidelines; detention arrangements and records of San Uk Ling Holding Centre (SULHC); background and identification of Special Tactical Contingent; media handling, doxxing against police officers and handling of misinformation, furnished in six main batches and subsequent follow-ups since September 2019;
- (b) meetings with the Police between October and December 2019 on Police operations on 9 June, 12 June, 1 July and 21 July 2019, detention arrangements at SULHC, cyberbullying against police officers, and Police media handling policy; further responses by the Police in February 2020 in respect of the incidents on 21 July, 11 August and 31 August 2019, and the detention arrangements at SULHC, and clarifications pertaining to the six incident days and SULHC;
- (c) operational orders, videos recorded by the Police pertaining to the operations on 9 June, 12 June, 1 July, 11 August, and 31 August 2019 (comprising a total of 96 video clips of about 18 hours long), detention registers and occurrence books of SULHC, police beat radio and 999 calls recordings on 21 July 2019, examined by IPCC Secretariat at the Police Headquarters between September and November 2019 and in February 2020 respectively;
- (d) visits to Police Tactical Unit (PTU) Headquarters for demonstrations of the equipment and weapons used by the Police and different strategies in anti-riot

operation of PTU Company in August and September 2019; and

- (e) visits to police stations in Tsim Sha Tsui and Wong Tai Sin, and Wong Tai Sin Disciplined Services Quarters by representatives of TFSG and IEP in September 2019, and visit to detention facilities at SULHC and Sheung Shui Police Station in October 2019.

3.8 In addition to the above information, the Police has provided the IPCC with a Management Response on each of the incident days. This Management Response is included in all relevant Chapters.

3.9 Materials were also obtained from other sources (in no specific order) via information requests, meetings and site visits:

Fire Services Department

- Ambulance service logs and relevant information relating to the events on 31 August and SULHC at meetings in October 2019 and subsequent follow-ups.

MTR Corporation Limited

- CCTV records, damage reports, and voice communication records between MTR Operations Control Centre and the Police, Fire Services Department (FSD) / Ambulance personnel concerning various days under study, comprising a total of 259 video clips of about 458 hours long, 9 damage reports, and 126 audio clips of about 80 minutes, received in October 2019.
- Supplementary information relating to events at MTR stations on 21 July, 11 August, and 31 August 2019.
- Visits to Yuen Long Station, Prince Edward Station and Kwai Fong Station.

Legislative Council

- Information on damages provided by Legislative Council (LegCo) Secretariat at meeting and site visit to LegCo Complex in July 2019.

CITIC Limited

- CCTV records of 12 June and 1-2 July at Lung Wui Road and Tim Mei Avenue provided

by CITIC Limited in September and November 2019 respectively, comprising a total of 258 video clips of about 286 hours long.

- Visit to CITIC Tower and the vicinity.

Hospital Authority

- Statistical information on persons sustaining injuries during the POEs from 9 June to 24 November received from Hospital Authority in November 2019.

Public Information from Relevant Organisations

3.10 The IPCC has also made reference to the following sources of information:

- (a) Press releases and POEs-related information published by the Police (*police.gov.hk*) and information given at Police media briefings;
- (b) Press releases of the Government and news published through Information Services Department (*news.gov.hk* and *isd.gov.hk*);
- (c) Press statements and documents published by LegCo including records of LegCo Meetings and replies to LegCo Questions (*legco.gov.hk*);
- (d) Press releases of MTR Corporation Limited (MTRC) regarding the incidents on 21 July, 11 August and 31 August 2019 (archived at *www.mtr.com.hk*); and
- (e) Information given by FSD at press conference in September 2019 in relation to the Prince Edward Station Incident on 31 August.

Information from Social Media

3.11 The IPCC also looked for information on internet forums, social media and video-sharing platforms, such as LIHKG (*lihkg.com*), Hong Kong Discuss Forum commonly known as DISCUSS (*discuss.com.hk*), HKGolden (*hkgolden.com*), Facebook (*facebook.com*) and YouTube (*youtube.com*). However, some instant messaging Apps, such as Telegram, are not fully accessible to the public, and access to certain chat groups within the App is restricted to some account holders only.

Appeal for Information from the Public

3.12 The IPCC has set up a dedicated platform to appeal to the public for any information related to the POEs and incidents since 9 June 2019 through email (*taskforce@ipcc.gov.hk*),

WhatsApp (9781 9840), or telephone (2862 8200). As at 29 February 2020, information from the public was received via 12 217 emails (including 9 838 template emails supporting the police officer's firing of live round in Tsuen Wan on 1 October 2019), 658 WhatsApp users, 112 telephone calls, four letters and one digital video disc (DVD) by mail/by hand. A summary of the information and distribution of such is set out in Table 3-1 and Table 3-2 below. A sample of the IPCC "Call for Information" form and further analysis of the information received from the public are at Annex 2.

	Photo attachments	Video attachments/links
Email	2 562	3 347
WhatsApp	20 988	19 186
Total	23 550	22 533

Table 3-1 Information received from the public

Incident Day	Number of submissions from members of the public (Photo / Video)
Sunday 9 June 2019 (Chapter 7)	730 / 699
Wednesday 12 June 2019 (Chapter 8)	1 460 / 1 397
Monday 1 July 2019 (Chapter 9)	1 366 / 1 307
Sunday 21 July 2019 (Chapter 10)	1 295 / 1 239
Sunday 11 August 2019 (Chapter 11)	1 083 / 1 037
Saturday 31 August 2019 (Chapter 12)	1 319 / 1 262

Table 3-2 Distribution of information received from the public on the six incident days

Live Footage and Media Reports

3.13 Live news footages from ten local electronic media and their online webcast platforms covering POEs between June 2019 and February 2020, daily news clipping from 33 print local media (newspapers and magazines), as well as coverage from nearly 200 local, regional and international web outlets via monitoring services provided by Wisers Information Limited and the subscription to three overseas newspapers facilitate the IPCC Secretariat's research and corroboration of facts. In addition, the IPCC also took reference of reports and videos footage from other websites and local online forums to support or verify the reconstruction of

chronology of the incidents. A summary of the media reports examined in this Study is as follows:

Incident Day	Number of news articles	Number / Duration of news footage
Sunday 9 June 2019 (Chapter 7)	171	53 / around 48 hours
Wednesday 12 June 2019 (Chapter 8)	318	281 / around 163 hours
Monday 1 July 2019 (Chapter 9)	68	138 / around 120 hours
Sunday 21 July 2019 (Chapter 10)	294	70 / around 107 hours
Sunday 11 August 2019 (Chapter 11)	213	102 / around 101 hours
Saturday 31 August 2019 (Chapter 12)	252	112 / around 117 hours

Table 3-3 Media reports examined on the six incident days

Analysis of Information

3.14 Given the time constraint and the availability of information from different sources, the examination of material for reconstructing the chronology of each incident day proceeded in parallel with the information gathering process. In corroborating the facts, live footage and video clips sourced from the media were cross-referenced with maps, news reports, public information and subsequently verified against information from the Police, CITIC Limited, MTRC and FSD. The IPCC has made the best efforts possible to check information against different sources to establish the facts and chronology of the incidents.

3.15 Within the IPCC's powers and scope for conducting the Study, the TFSG has fully taken the IEP's advice to give a factual and impartial report on the incidents in a balanced, even-handed way with reference to the context, and structure the observations on what distilled from the facts in the chronology. In line with the approach as discussed with IEP during their visit to Hong Kong in November 2019, rigorous comparison, counter-checking and matching of various sources of information on particular episodes of an incident have been undertaken to ensure reasonable grounds to substantiate the findings and to support the analysis. Sources of information for reconstructing the chronology of specific incidents / topics are listed in the respective Chapters.

3.16 Along the fact finding process, graphics (e.g. maps and floor plans) and photos were found in the public domain. Selection of the graphics and photos for use in the Report was based on a number of factors, such as the information that the graphics and photos sufficiently covered the incidents / topics under study and whether the IPCC could get copyright consent.

Not all copyright owners were willing to give consent or the consent fees were pitched at prohibitively high levels. Notwithstanding these set-backs, the IPCC is satisfied that the graphics and photos with publication permission obtained did sufficiently substitute the information of the photos and graphics for which no permission was granted.

Points to Note

3.17 The Report is based on information available to the IPCC up to 29 February 2020. This information was collected on a voluntary basis. The IPCC has no investigatory powers to compel the disclosure of information.

3.18 Unless otherwise specified, the dates and times cited in this Report refer to the year of 2019 and local Hong Kong time (i.e. Coordinated Universal Time plus eight hours) in 24-hour clock format with hours and minutes in two digits (e.g. 21:00). Calendar dates in the general format of day, month and year (e.g. 9 June 2019) and in brief format of year-month-day (e.g. 2019-06-09) are used interchangeably in the Report. Details of time in the chronology of incidents are approximate having regard to certain slight variations between different sources. Similarly, quantifiable descriptions, such as number of participants or protesters present at particular junctures, were estimates based on media reports, Police information, or manual counting from photos or video snapshots. Whilst every effort has been made to ensure accuracy of the information, the contents may not be an absolute or complete account of the incidents.